



407 Sansome St., 4th floor
San Francisco, CA 94111

COMMENTS SUBMITTED VIA EMAIL TO: ghg@deq.virginia.gov

April 9, 2018

Karen G. Sabasteanski
Office of Regulatory Affairs
Department of Environmental Quality
PO Box 1105
Richmond, VA 23218

RE: 3Degrees Inc.'s Comments on Virginia Department of Environmental Quality's Proposed Regulation for a CO₂ Budget Trading Program

Dear Ms. Sabasteanski,

Thank you for this opportunity to provide comments to Virginia Department of Environmental Quality ("DEQ") on the proposed CO₂ Budget Trading Program, Part VII of 9VAC5-140 published in the Virginia Register of Regulations on January 8, 2018.

3Degrees Inc. ("3Degrees") is a leading provider of renewable energy and carbon mitigation products, programs, and services. To this end, 3Degrees serves hundreds of corporate and institutional customers, and works closely with utilities across the country to help them serve thousands of residential customers through our utility green power program partnerships. As a marketer of renewable energy certificates ("RECs") and carbon offsets, 3Degrees works directly with renewable energy generators, including many in Virginia, in order to help them find a market for their RECs. In some cases, 3Degrees' REC purchases have directly and materially contributed to the development of new renewable energy projects in Virginia. 3Degrees is also a leading project developer working with dozens of emissions reductions projects in various sectors to produce high-quality carbon offsets. In 2017, 3Degrees became the first project sponsor to be awarded CO₂ offset allowances under the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative ("RGGI").

3Degrees applauds the Commonwealth's decision to implement a CO₂ Budget Trading Program and join RGGI. This decision will secure the Commonwealth as a national climate leader, and greatly expand the scope of the regional carbon market, improving market efficiency and lowering costs of compliance across the region.

While 3Degrees generally supports DEQ's proposed regulation, we encourage DEQ to incorporate two specific provisions into the final CO₂ Budget Trading Program in order for it to be its most successful and leave opportunities available for private investments in renewable energy and other market-based carbon reduction activities in the Commonwealth.

1. 3DEGREES ENCOURAGES INCLUSION OF A VOLUNTARY RENEWABLE ENERGY MARKET SET-ASIDE, IN LINE WITH SEVEN OTHER RGGI STATES AND AS OUTLINED IN SECTION XX-5.3(I) OF THE RGGI MODEL RULE.

Without a voluntary renewable energy market set-aside, the CO₂ Budget Trading Program could undermine and discourage private investments in renewable energy in the Commonwealth of Virginia. 3Degrees is concerned with the effect that the CO₂ Budget Trading Program could have on the ability of private companies and citizens to purchase high quality renewable energy generated in Virginia. Private demand for renewable energy in Virginia (sometimes referred to as the “voluntary market”) is evidenced by the success of renewable energy programs offered by two of the Commonwealth’s Investor-Owned Utilities (IOUs), the introduction of new renewable energy purchase options such as community solar, and the growing demand from corporate purchasing of renewable energy in the form of Green Tariffs that directly support renewable energy generation from Virginia. All of these purchasing options are often pursued by customers who are motivated by desires to support local Virginia supply and address climate change.

Today, when customers choose to voluntarily purchase renewable energy generated in Virginia, they are purchasing renewable energy that contributes to net emissions reductions in the Commonwealth. The purchasing that occurs in the voluntary market comes with the expectation that the purchase will be above and beyond state regulation. This means that the renewable energy not be counted towards a state mandate in the form of compliance with a renewable portfolio standard (“RPS”) and that the renewable energy contribute to emissions reductions on the grid beyond what is required by law.

With the implementation of the CO₂ Budget Trading Program, the emissions reduction benefit of voluntary renewable energy purchases risks being eroded. The CO₂ Budget Trading Program as written does not provide any avenues for voluntary market customers to ensure that their renewable energy purchase contributes to emissions reductions beyond regulation. As such, a customer purchasing renewable energy generation from Virginia once the CO₂ Budget Trading Program is in place will no longer be able to credibly claim that this renewable energy leads to an avoided emissions benefit on the grid (by displacing fossil fuel emitting resources) beyond what is required by the CO₂ Budget Trading Program.

In order to ensure that the renewable energy contributes to emissions reductions beyond regulation, carbon allowances must be paired with the renewable energy in an amount equal to the avoided CO₂ emissions associated with the generation of the renewable energy. The Voluntary Renewable Energy Market Set-aside (“renewable energy set-aside”) allows allowances to be paired with renewable energy at no added cost to the voluntary market. In order to support private investments in renewable energy, seven of the existing RGGI states and California have all implemented a renewable energy set-aside. RGGI provides language for a renewable energy set-aside mechanism in Section XX-5.3(I) of the RGGI Model Rule. This mechanism sets aside roughly 2% of the total allowances in a state in any given year and makes them available for free to be paired with voluntary renewable energy purchases.

The renewable energy set-aside will lead to continued demand for Virginia generation in the voluntary market and allow the generation to continue to be eligible for Green-e Energy certification. In addition to the avoided emissions benefit being critically important in the private investment decisions of many voluntary purchasers, it is also a requirement of Green-e Energy certification. Green-e Energy certifies tens of millions of megawatt hours (MWh) of renewable energy every year, including renewable energy generated in Virginia, and, as the only certification for the voluntary renewable energy market in the United States, is the de facto standard for private purchasing of renewable energy in North America. Where states or provinces have introduced cap-and-trade regulation without a renewable energy set-aside, Green-e has required that Green-e Energy certified renewable energy from these states or provinces be matched with purchased allowances equal to the generation's emissions reduction benefit on the grid. This adds a significant cost to renewable energy from these states or provinces, such that they generally exit the Green-e / voluntary market. Where private purchasing of allowances is not possible, such as in Delaware, Green-e has made the generation from that state ineligible for certification.

If Virginia generation is not eligible for Green-e Energy certification, or becomes prohibitively expensive, Virginia generation will be a less desirable option for voluntary purchasing and will lose financial support from the voluntary market. Since Virginia currently only has a RPS goal, the primary markets for Virginia renewable energy generation are adjacent state RPS (where the renewable energy is then claimed by another state) or the voluntary market. The voluntary market is currently the primary way that high quality renewable energy remains in the Commonwealth.

Many local projects risk losing voluntary market support if the renewable energy set-aside is not included in the CO₂ Budget Trading Program. 3Degrees has worked closely with a number of small-scale and residential solar and wind projects in Virginia, supporting the projects by facilitating the sale of the premium RECs from these projects for use by voluntary customers. Through these transactions and other sales, 3Degrees has purchased and facilitated voluntary customer purchases of RECs representing over 300,000 MWh of Virginia-sited renewable energy since 2009. From our experience, the voluntary market is generally providing funding for projects that would not receive funding from compliance REC markets, and often providing more funding per MWh. In some cases, the projects would be not financially viable without this revenue stream. If the voluntary renewable energy set-aside is not included in the CO₂ Budget Trading Program, there would no longer be an opportunity for 3Degrees to support projects of this kind in Virginia. 3Degrees urges the DEQ to continue to encourage private capital investing in renewable energy in the Commonwealth by including the renewable energy set-aside.

The renewable energy set-aside is important to continue to encourage private investment in renewable energy in the Commonwealth, which will promote local jobs, local investments, and further reduce greenhouse gas emissions in the Commonwealth.

2. 3DEGREES ENCOURAGES INCLUSION OF REGULATION RELATING TO CO₂ EMISSIONS OFFSET PROJECTS FROM VIRGINIA, AS OUTLINED IN SUBPART XX-10 OF THE RGGI MODEL RULE.

3Degrees encourages DEQ to include Subpart XX-10 of the RGGI Model Rule in the CO₂ Budget Trading Program regulation. This section will allow the issuance CO₂ Emissions Offset Projects from Virginia-sited projects. High-quality carbon offsets can be an important tool for a successful and economic cap-and-trade program. While carbon offsets have not been used to date for compliance in RGGI, as the cap lowers we believe carbon offsets will be an important tool for achieving emissions reductions cost effectively while encouraging and stimulating innovative climate solutions within the Commonwealth of Virginia. CO₂ Emissions Offset Projects can address emissions reductions in uncapped sectors and provide other co-benefits to the Commonwealth.

3Degrees appreciates this opportunity to provide comments to DEQ as the department seeks to develop an effective market-based carbon policy. By including the two sections we have outlined above, the CO₂ Budget Trading Program can lead to the desired results while also encouraging and preserving opportunities in the Commonwealth for private investment in renewable energy and carbon reduction projects. We look forward to continuing to engage with DEQ throughout this process and welcome the opportunity to answer any questions on our proposal or discuss our comments in more detail.

Sincerely,



— Maya Kelty —
Senior Manager, Regulatory Affairs